

Chinatown Families

Economic Self-Sufficiency Coalition



“Building Bridges to Help Chinese Families Reach
Economic Self-Sufficiency”

FINAL REPORT

November 21, 2005

PREPARED BY: National Economic Development and Law Center
Susie Smith, Tim Lohrentz, Tse Ming Tam



SUBMITTED TO: Chinatown Families Economic Self-Sufficiency Coalition
San Francisco, CA

As of the date of this report, the Chinatown Families Economic Self-Sufficiency Coalition includes the following organizations:

Asian Perinatal Advocates, Asian Women's Resource Center, Cameron House, Charity Cultural Services, Chinese for Affirmative Action, Chinese Newcomers Service Center, Chinese Progressive Association, City College of San Francisco, Jewish Vocational Services, Kai Ming Head Start, Maintrain, NICOS Chinese Health Coalition, Self-Help for the Elderly, and Wu Yee Children's Services

The cover photograph was taken by Lisa Lee

Acknowledgements

The Chinatown Families Economic Self-Sufficiency Coalition would like to thank the following people for their support of this project:

- Adela Gaytan, Evelyn and Walter Haas, Jr. Fund
- Alex Ng, Chinese Newcomers Service Center
- Alex Tom, Chinese Progressive Association
- Alison Ma, Asian Women's Resource Center
- Andrew Russo, Wu Yee Children's Services
- Angela Chu, Chinatown Community Development Center
- Annie Cheung, Mission Language and Vocational School
- Annie Kuang, San Francisco Labor Council
- Binh Trinh, Cameron House
- Brendan Leung, Annie E. Casey Foundation
- Brian Cheu, Mayor's Office of Community Development
- Calvin Chan, Chinese Center Employment Agency
- Doreen Der-McLeod, Cameron House
- Ellie Fernandez-Asenloo, Mission Hiring Hall
- Fion Chan, Wu Yee Children's Services
- George Marshall, Chinatown Community Development Center
- Gloria Tan, Asian Women's Resource Center
- Gordon Mar, Chinese Progressive Association
- Hedy Chang
- Hoi Yee Cheung, SRO Families United
- Homer Teng, Wu Yee Children's Services
- Jamie Brewster, Asian Neighborhood Design
- Jerrica Hau, Mission Hiring Hall
- Jim Torrens, Jewish Vocational Services
- Joanne Low, City College of San Francisco
- Joseph Chow, Self-Help for the Elderly
- Julia Ling, Chinese Newcomers Service Center
- Karen Lam, Kai Ming Head Start
- Kathy Sin, Kai Ming Head Start
- Lilian Tan, Asian Women's Resource Center
- Lily Lo, Northeast Community Federal Credit Union
- Linda Asato, Wu Yee Children's Services
- Linda Chu, Chinese for Affirmative Action
- Lise Maisano, S.H. Cowell Foundation
- Lucy Tao, Asian Women's Resource Center
- Mai Mai Ho, Asian Perinatal Advocates
- Marco Cheng, Asian Perinatal Advocates
- Margaret Kelch, Career Resources Development Center
- Mark Mak, Self-Help for the Elderly
- Mark Yuen, Asian & Pacific Islander Business Information Services
- Michael Mitton, Consultant
- Monica Seay, Self-Help for the Elderly

- Nicole Combs-Walker, Asian Neighborhood Design
- Olivia Chan, Charity Cultural Services
- Phyllis McGuire, City College of San Francisco
- Rebecca Cleff, Kai Ming Head Start
- Rita Poon, Asian Perinatal Advocates
- Robert Godfrey, Maintrain
- Ronnie Rhoe, Chinese for Affirmative Action
- Stella Ng, Chinese for Affirmative Action
- Sherry Tennyson, Chinese Newcomers Service Center
- Steven Currie, Goodwill Industries
- Steven Ng, Maintrain
- Susan Smith, National Economic Development and Law Center
- Tim Lorentz, National Economic Development and Law Center
- Tina Zhao, San Francisco Labor Council
- Tom Ryan, San Francisco Labor Council
- Tse Ming Tam, National Economic Development and Law Center
- Wei Ling Yang, International Chinese Affairs
- Yulanda Kwong, Cameron House

*The Chinatown Families Economic Self-Sufficiency Coalition would like to give a special thanks to the 51 parents and 20 employers who participated in the focus groups, the Evelyn and Walter Haas, Jr. Fund and the S.H. Cowell Foundation which funded this project, and Patelco Credit Union which donated the printing costs.
Thank you!*

This project was made possible through the generous support of:

The Evelyn and Walter Haas, Jr. Fund
&
S.H. Cowell Foundation

Table of Contents

I. Introduction	1
II. Research Methodology	2
III. Labor Market Research	4
Step 1: Demand Analysis	5
Step 2: Mobility.....	6
Step 3: Self-Sufficiency Wages.....	7
Step 4: Accessibility	7
Step 5: Comparison Analysis: Putting it all Together	9
IV. Demographic Profile	12
a. Overview.....	12
b. Income & Employment.....	12
c. Transportation to Work.....	13
d. Education	13
e. Language.....	14
f. Mobility.....	15
Key Demographic Characteristics.....	16
V. Resident Focus Group Findings.....	17
a. Work History, Self-Sufficiency Wages & Commute Time	17
b. Job Interests & Perceptions	18
c. Barriers to Obtaining Jobs with self-sufficiency wages.....	19
d. Barriers to train for jobs with self-sufficiency wages.....	20
e. Approach to job searching & accessing family support services	21
f. Level of customer satisfaction with family support services.....	22
g. Prioritization of family support and employment-related services....	22
Key Observations from Resident Focus Groups	25
VI. Employer Focus Groups.....	26
a. Healthcare Sector	26
Key Observations from Health Care Sector	31
b. Financial Services.....	32
Key Observations from Financial Services Sector.....	36
VII. Family Support and Employment Service Mapping.....	37
VIII. Recommendations – Gaps and Opportunities.....	43
IX. Appendices	
Appendix A – Labor Market Information for San Francisco	46
Appendix B – Demographic Information, Chinese Residents of San Francisco	60
Appendix C – Resident Focus Groups & Service Mapping	69
Appendix D – CFESC Work Plan & Survey Instruments.....	73

INTRODUCTION

Founded in 2004, The Chinatown Families Economic Self-Sufficiency Coalition (CFESC) seeks to support limited English speaking immigrant Chinese families to achieve economic self-sufficiency by training and connecting parents to employment in fields that provide living wages, benefits, and advancement potential.

The Coalition, as of the date of this report, is a partnership of the following member agencies: Asian Perinatal Advocates, Asian Women’s Resource Center, Cameron House, Charity Cultural Services, Chinese for Affirmative Action, Chinese Newcomers Service Center, Chinese Progressive Association, City College of San Francisco, Jewish Vocational Services, Kai Ming Head Start, Maintrain, NICOS Chinese Health Coalition, Self-Help for the Elderly, and Wu Yee Children’s Services.

NEDLC used quantitative and qualitative research methods to develop this report. NEDLC analyzed demographic and labor market information, as well as focus groups and a service provider survey in an effort 1) to identify structural barriers that prevent Chinese parents from working in growing industries which provide self-sufficiency wages and career mobility and 2) to identify existing gaps in family support and employment-related services needed to overcome those barriers. Ultimately, this report is intended to serve as a program planning and design tool to improve family support and employment related services for Chinese families in growing sectors of the local economy.

This research could not have been completed without the substantial in-kind support from members of the CFESS Coalition. This in-kind support included recruiting clients, organizing focus groups, providing volunteer bilingual facilitators and recorders, and guiding the research process.



RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The purpose of this research is to address the following sets of questions:

1. What are the growth industry sectors in San Francisco with occupations that can provide self-sufficiency earnings, and what are skills and education needed to compete for those jobs?
2. In which industries are Chinese residents of San Francisco currently clustered?
3. Which family support and/or employment training services do Chinese parents need to help them access jobs with self-sufficiency wages?
4. To what extent do Chinese families know about the different family support and employment services available to help them compete for jobs with self-sufficiency wages?
5. What challenges have Chinese families faced both in competing for employment and accessing family support and training services?

Representatives of the Coalition members met seven times to guide the research process and provided the following assistance: a) feedback with the development and translation of the focus group survey instruments; b) recruitment and hosting of focus groups; c) provision of bilingual facilitators and recorders; d) review and feedback of the draft report and e) planning implementation steps. Wu Yee Children's Services and NEDLC developed a work plan that was approved by the Coalition with timelines, tasks and roles for the participating partners. Attached in the Appendix, D1-D3, are the approved work plan and the focus group instruments.

NEDLC provided training for the focus group facilitators and note-takers. The training provided the volunteers with an introduction to the research project and the focus group questions, an overview of some of the “do’s” and “don’ts” of facilitation and useful techniques to engage participants, and a role-playing session.

Primary research was performed in three phases.¹ While NEDLC conducted demographic and labor market research, the Coalition organized and conducted five focus groups of the target resident population, two focus groups of employers in growing industries, and a survey of 23 job training and family support service providers.

Phase I: the Coalition held five focus groups with 51 Chinese parents who have children under the age of 18. Aggregate characteristics of the group are bulleted below:

- **Gender:** 35 (69%) female and 16 (31%) male;

¹ Primary research is defined here as original qualitative and quantitative research (e.g. focus groups, newly conducted surveys, and raw U.S. Census data.)



- ***Ethnicity:*** All members are Chinese and nearly all (48) speak Cantonese as their primary language; 3 spoke Mandarin;
- ***Employment Status:*** roughly half (27) are employed (part- or full-time); roughly half (23) are unemployed;
- ***Location:*** roughly half (26) live in Chinatown (defined by zip codes 94108 or 94133;); roughly half (25) live outside of Chinatown but access services in Chinatown.

Phase 2: the Coalition held two employer focus groups, one with representatives from the health care sector, the other with representatives from the financial services sector.

Phase 3: the Coalition lead agency, Wu Yee Children's Services, created and conducted a mapping survey of job training and family support providers that serve the Chinese population in or near Chinatown.

Quantitative research was performed in two phases. NEDLC collected San Francisco area labor market information data on local employment projections, education and training requirements for occupations in growing sectors, occupational wages, the self-sufficiency standard for San Francisco, and the percentage of Chinese residents working in growing industries. This research was used to identify sectors which are accessible to the target population and have living wages with the possibility of upward mobility. The labor market research enabled the Coalition to choose sectors for further qualitative research. The majority of this data comes from the California State Employment Development Department.

Second, NEDLC collected detailed demographic data on variables such as age, gender, income, English proficiency, year of arrival to the US, and educational attainment. This research identified the skills and background of the target population in order to see if there is a match (or mismatch) between the skill set of Chinese families and those needed to enter growing industries with living wages. The majority of this data comes from the 2000 U.S. Census Public Use Microdata Sample (PUMS) Files.

LABOR MARKET RESEARCH

Labor Market Research

Labor market research provides a snapshot of the overall structure of a regional economy and can be useful for identifying broad trends that will affect local employment patterns and workforce development needs. Therefore, a thorough examination of labor market data is the first step in identifying one or more industries that may be appropriate for the targeted population to gain access to family self-sustaining earnings.

NEDLC used California Economic Development Department data to identify industries that meet the following criteria: high demand, accessibility, self-sufficiency wages, and career mobility. NEDLC looked at 16 broad economic sectors: Construction; Manufacturing; Transportation & Utilities; Wholesale Trade; Retail Trade; Finance Services (including insurance and real estate); Education; Health Services; Hotels & Dining, Non-Professional Business Services, Arts/Entertainment/Recreation; Health Care & Social Assistance; Education; Information; Professional/Technical Services; and Public Administration. Many of these sectors can be broken into component industries, referred to by NEDLC as “sub-sectors.”

Identifying Potential Target Industries

Based on the data and local needs and interests, NEDLC worked with the Coalition to narrow down the selection of a target industry, using the following criteria:

1. **High demand:** There should be new job creation in the targeted industry, or, if there is no new growth, the industry should account for a significant share of the county’s existing employment base and have a moderate-to-high turnover/retirement rate.
2. **Accessibility:** Only jobs that require less than a two-year Associate’s (AA) Degree or less than 12-months of on-the-job training are considered easily accessible to low-skill, limited English proficient workers. In addition, in this case NEDLC decided to measure accessibility by investigating which sectors and occupations have the highest and lowest percentage of Chinese workers, compared to San Francisco workers at large. By measuring over- or under-representation, the intuition here was to identify specific structural barriers that may prevent the targeted population from gaining access to those industries or occupations.
3. **Self-sufficiency wages:** There should be projected growth in occupations in the targeted industry that are capable of paying a self-sufficiency wage within a two-year time period. Using the Wider Opportunities for Women’s Self-Sufficiency Wage Standard, the annual self-sufficiency wage in 2003 for San Francisco is as follows:
 - Single Adult, No Children: \$28,012

- Two Adults, 2 children: (each adult earning) \$34,579
 - One Adult, Pre-school Child: \$50,239
4. **Mobility:** The targeted industry should offer opportunities for advancement, meaning that there is a career ladder comprised of occupations requiring successively higher levels of skills and education.

Step 1: Demand Analysis: Future Jobs

Information on the average number of job openings between 2001 and 2008 was collected from the California Employment Development Department. The number of projected job openings includes openings due to both projected employment growth and projected job separations (retirements or turnover). It is important to investigate both the *number* of projected job openings and the *percentage* of job openings within a sector because a small percentage increase may result in a large number of new jobs in a large sector. Analyzing the projected average number of job openings by total number and percentage increase, the following ten industries project the greatest growth:

Table 1, Industry Rankings – Average Annual Job Openings, 2001-2008

Industry Sector	Total Employment, 2001	Annual Average Openings	Annual Openings Due to Job Separations	Annual Openings Due to Employment Growth	Percent Increase (Annual Openings over Total Industry Employment)
Retail Trade	49,900	3,102	1,874	1,229	6.2%
Hotels & Accommodations	61,000	2,515	2,315	200	4.1%
Non-Professional Business Services	71,400	2,333	833	1,500	3.3%
Professional & Technical Services	34,300	2,291	1,934	357	6.7%
Public Administration	82,100	1,767	1,124	643	2.2%
Health Services	24,600	1,280	995	286	5.2%
Educational Services	15,500	1,255	1,055	200	8.1%
Construction	17,900	813	442	371	4.5%
Manufacturing	25,600	558	772	-215	2.2%
Financial Services	62,550	391	563	-171	0.6%

Source: California Employment Development Department (EDD) and NEDLC projections based on EDD data

Even though financial services and manufacturing are projected to have less than 600 annual openings through 2008, the Coalition decided to continue considering these two sectors. In the case of financial services, the Coalition knew of several financial institutions expanding services in Chinatown. In the case of manufacturing, Chinese residents have a higher incidence of employment than the overall population, indicating potential access to many of the projected openings. (See Table 2 below.)



Step 2: Mobility: Career Ladder

The next step analyzes the ability for workers to develop a career path within a particular industry by looking at the projected average number of annual openings at *each* occupation level within the industry and checking to see if the job openings would pay self-sufficiency wages within two years of employment. NEDLC presented data to the Coalition that broke down the projected job growth in each top industry by education and wage levels between 2001-2008. (Refer to the series of charts in the Appendix A, labeled Table A1, for this data.) Ideally, an industry that is projected to have a relatively equal number of job openings at each occupational level provides the clearest career path for its employees.

The growth sectors in San Francisco with the most clearly-defined career paths include Healthcare, Manufacturing, Construction, Public Administration and Professional & Technical Services. The sectors with the least clearly-defined career paths include Retail Trade and Hotels and Dining. Despite limited career paths, the Coalition decided *not to* eliminate Retail Trade or Hotels & Dining, at this point – both are accessible to limited-English speakers, and, in the case of Retail Trade, it is complimentary to the Financial Services sector, which similarly requires skills handling money. In addition, there are several well-developed job training and career ladder programs in San Francisco in Hotel and Dining that do offer at least some career ladder mobility. (The industry mobility data is based on state-wide trends and may not reflect specific county-wide trends.)

The Financial Services sector has a moderately well-defined career path. There are openings at the entry-level and the 1-12 month on-the-job training level. And there are openings at the BA and higher level. The important piece will be finding a way to help participants step up to the BA level – either creating new job categories that require a certificate or AA degree or helping incumbent workers advance toward BA-level degrees while continuing to work.

While Educational Services has a large number of projected annual openings at the entry level with self-sufficiency wages (at least for single adults) and a large number of openings at the Bachelor's level, there are not many openings in between levels, creating a bottleneck instead of a clear career ladder.

Step 3: Self-Sufficiency Wages

Healthcare, Financial Services, Manufacturing, Construction, Retail Trade or Hotels & Dining remained possibilities. Viewing these sectors through the wage lens reveals that Construction has the highest entry-level wages: 86% of the projected new, entry-level Construction jobs pay self-sufficiency wages for a single adult living in San Francisco and roughly 90-100% of the jobs at the next level up pay self-sufficiency wages for a single-adult, a single parent with a pre-school child, and a two-parent family with two children. Relative to other sectors, Healthcare and Manufacturing also provide decent starting wages and generally pay self-sufficiency wages by the second-tier of jobs that require at least 30 days of on-the-job training, a certificate, or AA degree. Manufacturing jobs pay self-sufficiency wages for nearly all of the three aforementioned family types. About half of the entry-level Health Care occupations pay self-sufficiency wages for a single adult; the second tier level healthcare occupations pay self-sufficiency wages for a single-adult and 82% pay self-sufficiency wages for a two-parent family with two children. Hotels & Dining and Retail Trade have the lowest percentage of self-sufficiency wages at the entry-level occupations, although the wages at unionized hotels are likely to be higher than the county-wide average. (Refer to the series of charts in the Appendix A, labeled Table A1, for a breakdown of each target industry by wage and required training/education.)

Step 4: Accessibility: Experience/Educational/Language Requirements

Most sectors have more job openings at the entry-level than at other levels, except Construction and Manufacturing in which there is a greater number of openings in jobs requiring one to twelve months of on-the-job-training. (See Appendix A, Table A1, for the number of openings at the entry-level.) In terms of absolute numbers, Retail Trade (2,175), Hotels & Dining (2,560) and Non-Professional Business Services (1,451) have, by far, the most number of jobs requiring less than 30 days of on-the-job-training.

Table 2 reveals the percentage of the Chinese population in San Francisco in each of the sectors, compared to the general San Francisco population. The intention is to analyze sectors in which the Chinese population is currently over- or under-represented in order to identify barriers to entry for this population. Sectors where the target population is underrepresented may be an indication of a structural barrier or may indicate a sector where English-language ability is more important; sectors where the target population is over-

represented may demonstrate accessibility or it may also reflect that Chinese workers are being funneled into certain sectors more than others. Compared to the San Francisco population, Chinese workers are **over**-represented in Manufacturing, Hotel & Dining, and the Healthcare sectors. Conversely, Chinese workers are **under**-represented in Non-Professional Business Services, Public Administration and Other Services.

Table 2, Employment by Industry Sector, San Francisco, 2000 Census		
	Chinese Population	Overall Population
Hotels & Dining	16.1%	10.5%
Manufacturing ²	12.8%	4.4%
Finance, Insurance, Real Estate	11.0%	12.7%
Retail Trade	9.8%	8.5%
Health Care	9.0%	4.2%
Professional & Technical Services	7.6%	5.9%
Education	5.5%	4.7%
Information/Communications/ Utilities	4.3%	3.4%
Other Services	4.3%	10.5%
Transportation	4.0%	2.7%
Construction	3.9%	3.1%
Non-Prof'l Business Services	3.1%	12.2%
Public Administration	3.1%	11.9%
Wholesale Trade	2.9%	3.2%
Arts/Entertainment/Recreation	1.7%	2.4%

On the other hand, the Coalition agreed that while Professional & Technical Services and Public Administration have quite clearly defined career paths, these sectors are likely to require a high level of English proficiency and therefore have relatively low levels of accessibility. Public Administration requires written civil servant examinations, which can be particularly challenging for limited English speakers. Thus, the Coalition decided to eliminate these sectors from further consideration. Both sectors should still be considered for potential lateral movement from a different sector into these sectors at a higher level, considering the strong wages and upper-level career paths. The Educational Services sector was also thought to require a high level of English proficiency and therefore taken out of consideration as well.

² Non-professional Business Services employment figure for San Francisco includes temporary work agencies, even if the person is placed at manufacturing. This is not true for the Chinese employment figures. The difference between Chinese and population at large in Manufacturing and non-professional Business Services is therefore probably not as great as this chart suggests.



Table 3 shows the top 11 occupations for the Chinese population in San Francisco. (See Appendix B, Table B20 for the entire list.) The 5.6% working as textile/garment workers explains some of the high participation rate in the manufacturing sector, although this has probably dropped since the 2000 census. Table 3 also shows a high level of Chinese working in occupations related to the Financial Services sector, even if some of these jobs may be in other industries, including 5.9% as accountants or finance specialists and 4.0% as financial clerks or bookkeepers. A number of other occupations are somewhat complimentary to the Financial Services sector, including: 6.1% as cashiers; 5.0% as office clerks; 4.1% in computer and math occupations; and 3.2% as information or record clerks. This helped the Coalition decide to choose Financial Services as one of the two sectors to choose for the employer focus groups.

Table 3: Occupations by Chinese Population in San Francisco, 2000 Census

Occupation	Total	Men	Women
Cashiers/ Retail Sales Person	6.1%	3.9%	8.1%
Accountants, Auditors, Finance Specialists	5.9%	4.7%	7.0%
Textile Workers, including sewing machine operators	5.6%	1.1%	9.9%
Office Clerk and other admin support	5.0%	3.1%	6.8%
Cooks, Food Preparation and cafeteria workers	4.9%	7.2%	2.8%
Housekeeping/Janitorial/Maintenance	4.9%	6.7%	3.1%
Computer and Math Occupations	4.1%	5.4%	2.8%
Financial Clerks and Bookkeepers	4.0%	2.8%	5.2%
Other Managers	3.3%	3.1%	3.5%
Information/Record Clerks	3.2%	2.6%	3.8%
Construction Worker	3.2%	6.5%	0.1%

Step 5: Comparison Analysis: Putting it all Together

Table 4 combines the analysis thus far and rates the growth sectors by each of the four criteria identified as excellent, good, fair, or poor. It reveals the following: 1) Retail Trade and Hotel & Dining are excellent for accessibility and demand but offer poor or fair wages and opportunity for advancement; 2) Healthcare and Construction are rated "fair" or above in all four criteria; and 3) Financial Services rated good for wages and mobility and fair for low-skill/LEP accessibility.

Table 4, Comparison of Top Growth Sectors				
Industry	Demand	Mobility	Wages	Low Skill & LEP Accessibility
Retail Trade	EXCELLENT	POOR	POOR	EXCELLENT



Industry	Demand	Mobility	Wages	Low Skill & LEP Accessibility
Hotel & Dining	EXCELLENT	POOR	FAIR	EXCELLENT
Non-Professional Business Services	EXCELLENT	FAIR	POOR	FAIR
Professional & Technical Services	GOOD	FAIR	EXCELLENT	POOR
Public Administration	FAIR	GOOD	EXCELLENT	POOR
Educational Services	GOOD	POOR	GOOD	POOR
Manufacturing	POOR	GOOD	GOOD	GOOD
Health Care	GOOD	EXCELLENT	GOOD	FAIR
Construction	FAIR	GOOD	EXCELLENT	GOOD
Financial Services	FAIR	GOOD	GOOD	FAIR

The Coalition eliminated Public Administration because it agreed that Public Sector occupations would be difficult for limited-English proficient workers and this intuition was confirmed by the data, which showed that Chinese workers are underrepresented in this sector. The Chinese population is over represented in Educational Services, Professional and Technical Services, and Manufacturing, so a few questions related to these sectors were included in the resident focus groups. However, Professional & Technical Services and Educational Services were later eliminated from consideration because, while they have good wages, they do not project a high number of entry-level jobs relative to the other sectors, they were thought to be difficult for limited English proficient population to access, and Educational Services does not have very clear career path mobility. On the other hand, for English speakers, these two sectors should be kept in consideration. Demand for Manufacturing is rated poor and, furthermore, Chinese workers (especially women) tend to be funneled into garment jobs within the manufacturing industry. These jobs are known to have particularly egregious work conditions. Thus, Manufacturing is not recommended. The Non-Professional Business Services sector has low wages and Chinese workforce participation in this sector is low, so it is not recommended.

Financial services has only fair demand overall, although demand in the Chinatown area is likely a little better. Due to the strong wages and mobility, the financial services sector is recommended. Despite some drawbacks, NEDLC still recommends that Hotel & Dining be considered for a future sector project due to: 1) the



Building Bridges to Help Chinese Families Reach Economic Self-Sufficiency

high number of entry-level jobs; 2) its accessibility for Chinese workers; and 3) there are a number of successful job training programs for hotel workers, including one by the UNITE-HERE union. This program, which has been shown to be successful in moving workers toward economic self-sufficiency, already has a large number of Chinese participants.

Five sectors under consideration for future research and employer partnerships include: Healthcare, Financial Services, Construction, Hotel & Dining, and Retail Trade. The Coalition should consider creating or partnering with job training agencies that serve any of these five sectors. Given resource constraints, NEDLC ultimately could only pursue further research through the employer focus groups on two sectors. The group, therefore, decided to choose the Health Care Sector and the Financial Services sectors for the employer focus groups. But Construction, Hotel & Dining, and Retail Trade should still be considered for sector-related job training initiatives.



DEMOGRAPHIC PROFILE

Using data from the 2000 US Census Public Use Microdata Sample (PUMS) Files, this section reports on demographic and employment characteristics of the target population: Chinese parents who either live in the Chinatown section of San Francisco or use services in Chinatown. Sandwiched between San Francisco's central business district and the North Beach neighborhood, Chinatown comprises roughly six square blocks in the northeast section of San Francisco. Chinatown is well-served by San Francisco's bus and cable car public transit system and only about a 15-minute walk to its suburban commuter rail system, the Bay Area Rapid Transit (BART.)

a. General Overview of the Target Population

According to the 2000 Census, Chinese residents of San Francisco number about 155,000 and comprise about 20% of the entire San Francisco population, the second largest racial/ethnic group, behind whites. The total population of working age Chinese residents in San Francisco is roughly 101,000, or 64% of all Chinese residents in San Francisco. Almost one out of every five Chinese residents, or 20%, is age 65 or older, and 17% is school-aged (compared to 14% and 12%, respectively, for the larger San Francisco population.) Fifty percent of Chinese residents are married, compared to only 34% of the total San Francisco population, and slightly more than three-fourths of the Chinese population in San Francisco are US citizens, two-thirds by naturalization and one-third by birth.

b. Income & Employment

Chinese residents of San Francisco earn far less than the median income for San Francisco residents as a whole. According to the 2000 Census, 35% of the Chinese population aged 18-65 (or 35,576 people), earned less than \$10,000 in 1999, compared to just 16% of the citywide population. Only 17% of the working age Chinese population earned \$40,000 to \$74,999, compared to 25% of the San Francisco population. Table B1 in the Appendix shows the complete income distribution for Chinese residents compared to San Francisco residents as a whole.

This income discrepancy is even more surprising considering that 73% of the Chinese population is in the labor force, compared to 63% of the citywide population. Twenty-five percent of those working age Chinese residents not in the labor force are in school. Chinese working age males have a 5% greater labor market participation rate



than Chinese working age females, compared to a 10% greater labor market participant rate among males citywide. Thus, gender does not appear to be a significant barrier to employment among Chinese residents.

c. Transportation to Work

Chinese residents have much shorter commute times than the general San Francisco population. Forty-percent of the working age population commutes less than 15 minutes, compared to just 15% of San Francisco residents at large. About one out of every three Chinese residents commutes by public transit, nearly the same as the general population, and 57% commute by private transportation (compared to 53% of the San Francisco population.) Sixty-eight percent of Chinese men use private transportation to get to work, compared to 50% of Chinese women. Lastly, a little more than three out of every four Chinese residents work in San Francisco, about the same as the larger San Francisco population. The shorter average commute time is likely due to working at a close distance to place of residence since the commuting mode is nearly equivalent to the population at large. This may be due to the large number of jobs within Chinatown and nearby downtown as well as to more limited job and career options.

d. Education

Table 5 displays the educational attainment level of the Chinese population age 25 and older in San Francisco, compared to that of San Francisco residents as a whole. Overall, the chart reveals that the Chinese population has a lower level of educational attainment. Thirty-seven percent of the Chinese population age 25 and older has less than a high school diploma, compared to 19% of the San Francisco population. Ten percent of the Chinese population has no schooling, more than double the rate of San Francisco residents as a whole. On the opposite end of the educational spectrum, about one out of every three Chinese residents has an associates or higher degree, compared to about one out of every two of San Francisco residents.

Table 5: Education Level, San Francisco population age 25 years and older		
	Chinese Population	Overall Population
Less than High School Diploma	37%	19%
High School Diploma & Some College	29%	31%
Associates Degree or More	34%	51%

Source: 2000 US Census



While working age Chinese men generally have higher rates of educational achievement than those of Chinese women, the differential is not more than 4% for most levels of attainment. (See Table B2 in Appendix B for a comparison of Chinese educational achievement by gender.) Not surprisingly, educational achievement positively correlates with earnings: 78% of those Chinese residents with less than a high school diploma earned less than \$20,000 in 1999, while 40% of those Chinese residents with a high school diploma or some college earned between \$20,000-\$70,000 in 1999. (See Table B3 in Appendix B for a complete breakdown of the earnings of Chinese residents compared to their educational achievement.)

Table 6 below displays the relationship between the arrival of the working age Chinese population to the U.S and their levels of educational attainment. The table reveals that educational attainment levels do *not* significantly increase with the length of time in the U.S. Thirty-two percent of Chinese residents who have been in the US for over 30 years, for example, have attained an associate’s degree or more, compared to 28% for those who have been in the US less than ten years, a small percentage increase in achievement for an additional twenty or more years in the US. This may indicate that more recent Chinese immigrants had higher educational attainment in China than their predecessors, nearly making up for the education received in the U.S. by immigrants who arrived 20 or 30 years ago. Those Chinese residents born in the U.S., however, do attain much higher levels of education: only 2% have less than high school degrees and 65% have an associate’s degree or more.

Table 6: San Francisco Chinese Population Age 18-65, Education Level by Year of Arrival			
Arrival to the U.S.	Less than High School Degree	High School and/or Some College	Associate's Degree or More
Over 30 Years Ago	38%	30%	32%
10-29 Years Ago	34%	34%	32%
Less than 10 Years Ago	37%	36%	28%
Total for Chinese Immigrants	27%	34%	39%
Born in US	2%	33%	65%

Source: 2000 US Census Public Use Microdata Sample (PUMS) Files

e. Language

According to the 2000 Census, about one out of every three working age Chinese adults do not speak English or do not speak it well. Slightly more than half of the Chinese working age population in San Francisco speaks English “well” or “very well,” in addition



to those born here who speak English as their first language. Males have a greater rate of English proficiency than women (57% v. 50%.) Age, not surprisingly, is related to English ability: 46% of those Chinese residents age 45-64 and 63% of those aged 65 or older do not speak English well or at all, compared to only 6% of those 18 or younger. Length of time in the U.S., on the other hand, does *not* correlate to English ability for the Chinese working age population. One-third of those who have arrived over 30 years ago do not speak English well or at all, about the same as rate as those who have been in the U.S. 10-29 years. (Refer to Table B4, in Appendix B for a complete breakdown of English ability by length of time in the U.S..)

Cross-referencing annual income with English ability, Table 7 reveals that about two-thirds of those working age Chinese residents who do not speak English well earn less than \$20,000 annually. It is difficult, in other words, to earn more than \$20,000/year with very limited English proficiency. Similarly, 36% of those *unemployed* working age Chinese residents in San Francisco do *not* speak English well, and 74% of those employed working age Chinese residents do speak English well.

English Ability	Less than \$20,000	\$20,000-\$70,000	Over \$70,000
Not well/not at all	63%	36%	1%
Well/very well	33%	62%	5%
English as first language	29%	58%	13%

Source: 2000 US Census Public Use Microdata Sample (PUMS) Files

f. Mobility Over Time in the U.S.

While the length of time in the U.S. does not necessarily correlate with Chinese residents' English ability or level of educational achievement, length of time in the U.S. positively correlates with Chinese residents' earnings. Table 8 shows that the income of working age Chinese residents increases significantly the longer that they are in the U.S.. Nearly six out of ten Chinese residents who lived in the U.S. for less than ten years earned under \$20,000 annually, compared to only about three out of ten Chinese residents who have been in the U.S. for over thirty years. Similarly, 66% of working age Chinese residents who have lived in the U.S. more than thirty years earn between \$20,000-\$70,000, compared to just 40% who have lived in the U.S. for less than ten years.



Arrival to U.S.	Less than \$20,000	\$20,000-\$70,000	Over \$70,000
Less than 10 Years Ago	58%	40%	2%
10-29 Years Ago	41%	56%	4%
Over 30 Yrs Ago	29%	66%	5%
Born in US	30%	59%	11%

Source: 2000 US Census Public Use Microdata Sample (PUMS) Files

Key Demographic Characteristics
<p><i>General</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is a slightly greater percentage of elderly and school-age Chinese residents in San Francisco, compared to the total San Francisco population. • Fifty percent of Chinese residents are married, compared to only 34% of the total San Francisco population. • Three-fourths of Chinese residents in San Francisco are U.S. citizens. <p><i>Income & Employment</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The labor force participation rate of the Chinese working age population is higher than that of San Francisco as a whole (73% v. 63%) and of those not in the labor force, a large percentage is in school. • 35,576 people, almost 35% of the Chinese population aged 18-65, earn less than \$10,000 a year, compared to just 16% of the citywide population. Thus, there is a large number of working poor Chinese residents in need. • The income of working age Chinese residents increases substantially the longer that they are living in the U.S.. <p><i>Transportation to Work</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gender does not appear to be a barrier to entering the labor force. • Forty percent of the working age population commutes less than 15 minutes, compared to just 15% of San Francisco residents at large. <p><i>Education & English Ability</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sixty-three percent of the Chinese population age 25 and older has a high school diploma, compared to 81% for the San Francisco population. • About one out of every three working age Chinese adults would need English as a second language (ESL) or vocational ESL classes in order to reach English language proficiency. • About two-thirds of those working age Chinese residents who do not speak English well earn less than \$20,000 annually • Chinese residents who have been in the U.S. longer are not necessarily any more proficient in English than recent arrivals.



RESIDENT FOCUS GROUP FINDINGS

PURPOSE AND PARTICIPANTS

In June and July 2005, five resident focus groups were held in Cantonese and Mandarin with a total of 51 working age Chinese parents who live in San Francisco.

Characteristics of the group are bulleted below:

1. **Gender:** 35 (69%) female and 16 (31%) male;
2. **Ethnicity:** All members are Chinese and nearly all (48) speak Cantonese as their primary language; 3 spoke Mandarin;
3. **Employment Status:** roughly half (27) are employed (part- or full-time); roughly half (23) are unemployed;
4. **Location:** roughly half (26) live in Chinatown (defined by zip codes 94108 or 94133;) roughly half (25) live outside of Chinatown but access services in Chinatown.

It should be emphasized from the outset that views expressed by the 51 residents of the focus groups do *not* necessarily represent the sentiments of *all* Chinese parents in San Francisco. Rather this qualitative feedback is meant to get a much more in-depth snapshot of a handful of issues that these residents face.

The resident focus groups were designed to gather information from members of the target population themselves about a variety of family support and job training-related issues. The Coalition hoped to learn more about the residents':

- a. Work history and knowledge of wages required for economic self-sufficiency;
 - b. Job interests and perceptions;
 - c. Barriers to obtain jobs with self-sufficiency wages;
 - d. Barriers to train for jobs with self-sufficiency wages;
 - e. Approach to job searching and accessing family support services;
 - f. Level of customer satisfaction with family support services; and
 - g. Prioritization of needed family support and employment-related services.
- a. ***Work History, Self-Sufficiency Wages & Commute Time***

A little over half of the focus group members are employed, and nearly all of the male members are employed. Two participants attend City College of San Francisco and one is in a vocational training program to become a chef. Most of the women in these focus groups are not in the labor force. Rather they are the primary caretakers of their children, and their husbands are the primary wage-earners.



Most of the residents' work experience is in low-wage, service sector and manufacturing jobs. Of those employed, the highest concentration of jobs is in food service (11), garment manufacturing (4) and office work (3). This finding is in keeping with the quantitative labor market data which shows an overrepresentation of Chinese residents employed in the Hotel and Dining Sector and the Manufacturing Sector, compared to San Francisco residents overall (e.g. 16% of San Francisco's working age Chinese population is employed in Hotel & Dining v. 11% of the total San Francisco population and 13% of the working age Chinese population is employed in Manufacturing, compared to 4% of San Francisco residents.)

Almost one out of every three residents reported commuting less than fifteen minutes to work. This sentiment is in keeping with the demographic data depicting that the average commute time for Chinese residents in San Francisco is less than the San Francisco population at large. For some, lack of private transportation is a barrier to work. One resident explained that after completing a house cleaning job training program, it was difficult for her to get to the houses to clean because of the commute time. Another resident suggested that the Coalition organize a carpool to help residents get to work more easily. Not surprisingly, residents who live outside of Chinatown tend to have longer average commute times than those who live in Chinatown.

b. Job Interests & Perceptions

When asked which occupations most interested them, participants reported: Hotel and Dining (12); Health Services (8); Educational Services (7); Retail Trade (7) (e.g. cashier); "office work" (2); and manufacturing (2) occupations. Female participants tended to cite a stronger interest in Education and Social Services (e.g. teaching and childcare) occupations, while male participants tended to cite a stronger interest in Hotel and Dining (e.g. janitorial and parking attendant) occupations.

Participants were asked about their specific knowledge of and feelings toward five relatively accessible growth industries identified in the labor market research: Healthcare, Manufacturing, Construction, Professional Services, and Education. Overall, the residents seemed to have a fairly accurate sense of these five sectors. However, there was a misperception that Professional Services is "dangerous" and does not provide benefits. In addition, most participants listed professional, rather than support or administrative positions, within the Education sector, and when asked to recall jobs in the

Healthcare sector, male residents tended to list only non-clinical occupations. (Female residents, however, tended to list a range of clinical and non-clinical healthcare occupations.) The participants seemed very familiar with the Manufacturing sector, most especially with textile, automobile and shoe factories.

While the residents in these focus groups overall liked the independence, stability, and limited English required in manufacturing jobs, they felt these jobs were “repetitive,” “dirty” and “hard.” While they tended to like the salary, the hands-on nature, and the benefits of healthcare jobs, they worried about getting sick, the training required and the pressure in these types of jobs. Table 9 below summarizes positive and negative sentiments expressed by the focus group members about each of the five sectors in question.

Industry	Positive Sentiments	Negative Sentiments
Healthcare	salary, practical aspects, benefits	pressure, get sick, training involved, hours, responsibility
Manufacturing	independence/autonomy, stable work hours, wages, satisfies market needs, no English needed, like working with products	wages, long hours, dirty, long commute, repetitive/uninteresting, work unhealthy environment, boring, skills not transferable
Construction	salary, practical, easy to find, flexible schedule	not good for health, dirty, physically demanding, conditions, no benefits, hard work
Professional Services	salary, professional/respected, salary, transferable skills	pressure, responsibility, easy to make mistakes, hard, dangerous, no insurance
Education	salary, vacation, benefits, less stressful, clean work environment, benefits, stable, vacation time	pressure, responsibility, brain work, salary, dependant on unstable public funding

c. Barriers to Obtaining Jobs with self-sufficiency wages

A number of the participants are mothers of children age five or younger. Many of these mothers explained that they did not work or attend school because of a lack of full-time, affordable childcare services. Even those mothers who do work reported that they only work part-time because they do not earn enough to make money after paying full-time childcare expenses. Most of these women are not actively seeking employment at this time and they may need a fair amount of guidance if they were to reenter the job market.



In general, the need for affordable childcare seemed to be more salient among the female focus group members. Other barriers cited more frequently by female participants included the need to take care of elderly parents, physical constraints and unfamiliarity with the US job market and job searching practices. Some residents said that their prior work experience in China is not recognized in the US, and others cited their “lack of relevant experience in this country” as an impediment. *Commonly discussed barriers among all participants include lack of English, education, and job skills.* Some also said that their older age is a barrier.

Most participants reported that the availability of job training would motivate them to apply for a job, as would encouragement from friends. Several residents reported that the opportunity to practice English would serve as an incentive to work. Others said that the availability of affordable childcare would be a motivating factor.

d. Barriers to train for jobs with self-sufficiency wages

Most of the female focus group members indicated a willingness to attend training in the four target sectors, with a stronger interest in Health Services and Professional Services. Effective training programs for the target population, however, would need to be free or low-cost, held at convenient hours, linked to childcare, and outcomes-oriented. Many of the participants who live outside of Chinatown and some of the Chinatown residents reported a willingness to attend training outside of Chinatown. The majority of the participants indicated that they would attend a 3-6 month training program, and many are willing to pay between \$100-\$500 for training, if employment is guaranteed upon completion.

Those residents who had participated previously in a training program said that they had learned new “hard” and “soft” skills. A few commented that even though their English was limited, they could understand the class because the instructor spoke slowly and was patient. A few members found employment after a house cleaning training program but one complained that the house cleaning jobs were too far away. Several members were frustrated that their training did not lead to employment afterward.

e. Approach to job searching & accessing family support services

Focus group participants were asked to identify how they received information about job openings, training programs and family support services. This information would identify mechanisms that the Chinatown FESS Coalition members could use to better market their services and connect clients to jobs and job training programs. Participants in the focus groups reported using a wide array of information sources to access jobs and job training programs, including: friends, non-profit organizations, government agencies (Employment Development Department,) job and street fairs, newspapers (Sing Tao and the San Francisco Chronicle,) radio (1400 and 1450 AM,) internet, flyers, and City College. Sources of information about family support services are not as widespread but include many of the same sources listed to access jobs and training programs. The focus group members who live outside of Chinatown additionally reported receiving information from television, churches, job referral centers (in Chinatown) and volunteer centers at their children's school. One focus group member who lives outside of Chinatown mentioned that she learned about family support services in Chinatown through a conversation with another mother in Golden Gate Park. Table C1 in Appendix C lists the information sources for job training and family support services by focus group.

When asked where they would go to get needed family support services, some participants specifically mentioned Wu Yee Children Services, Asian Perinatal Advocate, Asian Women Resource Center, Asian Family Support Center, On Lok Senior Services, and Self-Help for the Elderly—(although it should be reminded that these agencies helped recruit the focus group participants from their client base.) Less than one third of the male focus group members reported that they knew where to access family support services. This could be because their wives are the ones actively seeking out these services.

The next area of inquiry concerned the utilization of family support and employment-related services. Less than one-third of the male focus group members reported utilization of any of these family support services. Table 10 indicates a high utilization rate overall of childcare and support group services, with many residents also accessing soft skills training and counseling.



Childcare	30
Peer/Parent Support group	20
Soft skills training	10
Counseling/problem solve help	10
Home visits (e.g. teach parenting/child development skills at home)	5
Vocational training	3
Transportation	1
English tutoring	1

f. Level of customer satisfaction with family support services

Most of the residents who used family support services reported that they generally had positive experiences and appreciated that the services were in their native language. However, some residents did experience difficulties, particularly in applying for and receiving childcare services. Residents reported the following challenges to accessing childcare services:

- their families earned slightly too much to qualify for childcare;
- the application process was too long;
- there were no available pre-school slots, and priority slots are based on income;
- not enough information was communicated about the application process
- not enough information was communicated about the probability of receiving childcare services.

Chinatown Coalition member organizations should consider these concerns in evaluating and improving their childcare services.

g. Prioritization of needed family support and employment-related services

An important component of the focus group research was to collect the priority family support and employment-related needs of Chinese residents in San Francisco. This was conducted through two exercises in which each of the focus group participants were provided with three colored dots and a list of family support services. The different colored dots signified which of the family support or employment services are most important, second most important or third most important employment to them. If a



service was not among the three most important to them, participants were asked to leave that line blank. Participants first did this exercise by themselves and then placed their dots on a flipchart, so that the facilitator could aggregate the results and lead a discussion based on these rankings.

The following table denotes the priority of family support services, on aggregate and by focus group. A numerical value was assigned to each color dot to reflect residents’ priority family support service needs. The top three most important services identified for each group are shaded. Other services identified as needed but not of highest priority are marked by an “x.”

Table 11, Priority Family Support Services

Family Support Service	Overall	Male	Chinatown	Non-Chinatown
Childcare or Childcare Info & Referral	x	x	x	x
Medical, Mental Health or Dental Services	x	x	x	x
Translation Assistance	x	x	X	x
Housing Services	x	x	x	x
Public Benefits Advocacy	x	x	x	x
Case Management	x		x	
Emergency Support & Referral	x	x	x	x
Financial Ed. & Planning	x		x	x
Elder care	x		x	
Immigrant & Legal Services	x	x	x	x

Almost all of the services listed were identified as important to some degree, indicating that the target population, in general, has significant family support needs. Based on the voting, the three highest priority family support service needs for the group overall are: Childcare, Medical/Mental Health/Dental Services and Translation Assistance. All of the residents prioritized childcare information and referral services. The Male-Only and Non-Chinatown focus group members also ranked Public Benefits Advocacy highly. The Chinatown focus group members also prioritized housing services. While none of the residents listed either Emergency Support/Referral or Immigrant/Legal Services as a priority service needs, many ranked these as important.



Comparing residents’ use of services (Table 10) with the priority service needs listed above, there appears to be a gap in either the existence or the utilization of needed services among the Chinese residents in the focus groups. Table 11 reveals that medical services and translation assistance, for example, are high priority service needs but Table 6 shows that the focus group members are not utilizing these services. Either these services do not exist or they exist, but are under-utilized. (It is also possible that medical services and translation assistance did not immediately come to mind for the residents when asked about their use of services but medical services and translation did rank highly when the residents were specifically presented in a list of possible services.)

In addition to looking at family services, the focus group inquired about usage and need for employment-related services. The following table denotes the priority of employment-related services, on aggregate and by focus group. A numerical value was assigned to each color dot to reflect residents’ priority employment service needs. The top three most important employment service needs for each group are shaded. Other services identified as needed but not of highest priority are marked by an “x.”

Table 12, Priority Employment-Related Services				
Employment Services	Overall	Male	Chinatown	Non-Chinatown
Job Training	x	x	x	x
Job Search & Placement	x	x	x	x
ESL	x	x	x	x
Career Counseling	x	x	x	x
Job Readiness	x	x	x	x
College	x	x	x	x
Computer Classes	x		x	x
GED	x	x	x	
Transportation Assistance	x			x

Based on the voting, the three most important employment-related services are: Job Training, Job Search and Placement, English as a Second Language. Residents also ranked Career Counseling and Job Readiness as important, and many listed college, GED, and computer classes as needed but not of highest priority. Residents generally seemed most interested in training programs that enhance both “hard” (e.g. job training) and “soft” skills (e.g. job search, readiness and career counseling.) as well as job placement services. That transportation assistance was not listed as a priority service may indicate that Chinese residents’ short commute time does not reflect a transportation barrier.



Key Observations from Resident Focus Groups

Work History

- Most of the residents' work experience is in low-wage, service sector and manufacturing jobs.
- Many of the women in the focus group are the primary caretakers of their children under age five, and unemployed.

Job Interests & Perceptions

- Although most residents had a fairly accurate sense of occupations within the Healthcare, Manufacturing, Construction, Professional Services and Education professions, some residents had misperceptions about Professional Services and others had limited knowledge of the range of Healthcare and Education occupations.
- Residents named a number of both positive and negative attributes of each sector, with no clearly preferred sector.

Barriers to Employment & Interest in Job Training

- The most commonly discussed barriers to employment were lack of: affordable childcare, English, work experience in the US, education, and job skills.
- Residents are interested in attending job training if it is free or low-cost, held at convenient hours, linked to childcare, and leads to employment. Many expressed a strong preference for the training to be held in Chinese or geared toward a limited English proficient population.
- The availability of job training and affordable childcare, encouragement from friends and the opportunity to practice English would motivate many unemployed residents to enter the job market.

Sources of Employment & Family Support Information

- Residents reported using a wide array of information sources to access jobs and job training programs, including: friends, non-profit organizations, government agencies, job and street fairs, Chinese and English newspapers, Chinese radio stations, internet, flyers, and City College.
- Residents of Chinatown are more likely to rely on friends and local street fairs for information about services and programs, while non-Chinatown residents are more likely to rely on media.

Experience with Family Support Services

- Childcare, support groups, soft skills training and counseling were the family support services used by the greatest number of focus group members.
- Most of the residents appreciated that family support services are provided in their primary language.
- Some focus group participants experienced difficulties in applying for and receiving childcare services.

Prioritization of Needed Services

- Residents prioritized childcare information and referral, medical/mental health/dental, and translation assistance as the most important family support services to them (and then housing services and public benefits advocacy.) There appears to be a gap in some needed family support services.
- Job training, job search and job placement, and English as a second language classes were listed as the most important employment-related services.

EMPLOYER FOCUS GROUPS

Two focus groups with representatives of the Health Care and Financial Services sectors were held in July, 2005. In addition to verifying quantitative labor market data about growing occupations, the purpose of the focus groups was fourfold:

1. To understand the process by which employers recruit, screen, and select job applicants;
2. To develop a general picture of the work environment;
3. To gain insight into the workforce opportunities or challenges faced by industry representatives;
4. To find out if these sectors have opportunities for limited English proficient or bilingual Chinese workers.

The Health Care focus group was comprised of nine representatives from major public and private hospitals, home health care and hospice agencies, and long-term care facilities, which have anywhere from 40 to 9,000 employees. Many of the employers had facilities or offices in Chinatown.

The Financial Services focus group was comprised of ten representatives, including representatives from major financial institutions, non-profit credit unions, and life insurance companies. The financial service companies ranged in size from a two-branch community credit union to major national banks with over 100,000 employees.

A. Health Care

- *Occupations in Demand*

Like elsewhere in the country, San Francisco faces a labor shortage in almost all of the occupations within the Health Care sector, but most especially with registered nurses. Recent California state legislation requiring increased nurse-to-patient ratios has placed an even greater burden on the existing nursing pool. This increase in demand especially impacts home health care providers because home health care providers already have greater difficulty competing for nurses due to their lower pay-scale vis-à-vis acute care providers.

Many entry-level health care occupations can lead to self-sufficiency wages within two years of employment. Categorized by the type of occupation, the table below contains employer-verified data on the entry-level hourly wages and skill requirements for each occupation in demand, according to the health care representatives and labor

market research by NEDLC using California Employment Development Department (EDD) data. Overall, the employers said that the EDD wage data underestimates the occupational salaries by at least 25% because wages received from on-call and overtime assignments are not included.

Table 12, Health Care Occupations in Demand with Entry-Level Salary and Skill Requirements		
Support Occupations	Allied Health Occupations	Clinical and Technical Occupations
*Receptionist & Information Clerk <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$22,000/yr • 30-days OJT 	Medical Records Coder <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$40,000-\$50,000/yr • AA plus certificate 	Registered Nurse <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$80,000-\$100,000/yr • AA or higher
*Food Preparation Workers <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$16,000/yr • 30 days OJT; 6 months experience (no HS diploma) 	Occupational Therapist <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$31,000-35,000/yr • BA 	Radiology Technicians <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$52,000-\$62,000/yr • AA plus training program
*Maids & Housekeeping Cleaners <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$18,000/yr • 30 days OJT (no HS) 	Physical Therapist <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$50,000-\$60,000/year • BA or Masters degree 	Medical Assistant <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$25,000/yr • 1-12 mos. OJT; certificate
Health Educator (two levels) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$33,000-\$62,000 • 6 months OJT or MS 	Social Worker <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$30,000-34,000 • BA or masters 	Clinical Lab Scientist <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$30-40/hr • BA or BS
Eligibility Worker <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$41,000/yr • 2 yrs exp., (no H.S) 	Pharmacists <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$114,000/yr • 2-4 yr post-college degree 	*Nursing Aides, Orderlies, Attendants <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$22,000/yr • 30-days OJT
Activities Coordinator <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$40,000/yr • B.S., 1-2 yrs exp 	Speech Therapist <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$40,000/yr • Master's degree 	*Dental Assistant <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$25,000/yr • 1-12 mos. OJT
		License Practical & Licensed Vocational Nurse <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$41,000/yr • post-sec. Voc ed or AA

Source: California Employment Development Department & Employer Focus Group

*Data identified in EDD labor market research but not verified by local employer.

Note: OJT = “on-the-job” training.

While many healthcare occupations in high demand require high skill and educational levels, some lower level jobs are also in high demand. Growth occupations within the health care sector that may be accessible to a limited-English-proficient population include: entry-level housekeeping, entry-level dieticians, activity aides, and Environmental Services Department jobs (e.g. cleaning healthcare facilities, waste management, etc.)



- *Outreach and Recruitment*

Competition to find qualified healthcare workers is fierce. Healthcare employers recruit from the same small pool of labor, sometimes “steal people from each other,” and frequently offer sign-on hiring bonuses, especially for RNs. To attract employees, some of the larger employers have offered to arrange housing for new hires or negotiated compensation packages so that new employees can live in hotels in San Francisco during the week and rejoin their families, who may live as far away as Stockton or Sacramento, during the weekend.

Networking and word-of-mouth referrals are the most effective recruiting mechanisms, according to these health care managers. Most employers also find that recruiting through internships programs, post-secondary education and training programs can be very successful. Other strategies include advertising jobs at: company websites; jobs websites (e.g. Monster.com, Craig’s List); newspapers; and trade publications.

One large home health care agency exclusively recruits from two local schools for medical assistants. Other home healthcare providers do not partner with colleges because they said that home health care requires at least one year of prior field experience. In addition to the aforementioned sources, one home health care agency uses non-profit job training agencies (e.g. Arriba Juntos) and One-Stop career centers. Another long-term care provider tried to use One-Stop Career Centers but was not satisfied with the personnel hired from there. Others said that they are open to using non-profit and public agencies. With one exception, the health care representatives use temporary agencies, despite the increased costs.

Many of the employers reported that they have a strong need for bilingual Chinese employees but have difficulty finding them. In addition to posting job announcements in Chinese newspapers, one hospital serving mostly Chinese patients successfully recruits bilingual Chinese employees in Asia and pays for their legal sponsorship to the US.

One large home health care employer, who has a strong need for Chinese interpreters, expressed an interest in an employer-sponsored vocational educational program. “I wish that there was some program where we could offer English,” she said. Instead, at her agency, “non-Chinese speakers have learned enough Chinese to do the care we need” for their Chinese clients. One hospital employer actually provided

vocational English as a second language classes on-site, informally, to help improve the English skills of its Chinese workers. Another employer said that some of the Chinese job applicants had the vocational training but their English was still not good enough to hire them.

While most of the employers expressed a need for bilingual Chinese staff, none of them could list any occupations which do not require at least some degree of English proficiency. Occupations within the health care sector that require the least amount of English proficiency include: entry-level housekeeping, entry-level dieticians, activity aides, and healthcare facilities cleaners and waste management workers within environmental services departments. One home health care employer said that he had clients who actually wanted *monolingual* Cantonese or Mandarin home health aide workers. When asked how many either Chinese or limited English proficient employees they had, the employers reported that they had between zero and ten percent.

- *Selection and Screening Process*

In addition to the requisite training, certification and/or educational background for a given position, employers look for soft skills, defined as “customer service skills, values, teamwork, dependability, appropriate dress, timeliness, professionalism, and appropriate business conduct.” Several employers complained that many of their hires lack these skills; one said he wanted “no drama.” Attendance and promptness is particularly important for the home health care providers because if one employee is late or does not show-up to work, it impacts the entire schedule for the office. A few employers also commented that they looked for a consistent and reliable employment history.

Most of the employers do written and physical examinations and the exact test depends on the position. While criminal background checks are also required, a few of the employers said that as long as the applicant discloses the information, they would still consider the hire on a case-by-case basis.

The hiring process takes anywhere from one day to six weeks, depending on the job, the employer and if it is a unionized position. A new required background test has extended the hiring process for some health care providers. A few representatives from the smaller, long-term care facilities explained that they tried to hire quickly and perform the required tests the same day as the interview because they have difficulty competing

with the salary and benefits offered by the acute care providers. As a result of casting a wider net, this employer said that she uses the typical 90-day probationary period to screen out unqualified or ill-performing employees.

- *Work Environment*

Unionization rates vary from less than a third at one medical center to almost all at another. Larger facilities tend to have higher rates of union membership than smaller facilities. Regardless of unionization, size or type of facility, all of the health care providers offered benefits, including medical, dental, vacation, and sick time. Some also offered flexible time and student loan reimbursement. One of the home health care agencies offered paid time-off for training and another offered flexible schedules to continue education or training. All of the employers encourage their staff to pursue additional education and training and some provide automatic promotions as incentives.

When asked about working with community-based organizations to develop a customized training program, several employers expressed an interest, especially to recruit bilingual staff. One employer said that it would be most helpful if there is a certification as part of the program; another explained that a customized training program could help immigrants access public sector jobs and the City College system. One home health care provider, however, thought a community-based training program would only work for lower-level positions because homecare requires a higher level of education. Many employers expressed a strong need for vocational English as a second language program in the health care sector.

Most employers in the focus group reported that they try to promote internally whenever possible. The turn-over rate is highest among administrative positions and home healthcare aides. The most common reason for firing an employee is lack of soft skills. The most common reason why employees leave is that they take a job at another organization that offers more competitive wages.

Key Observations from Health Care Sector Employers Focus Group

Occupations in Demand

- Numerous support, allied health and clinical entry-level positions are in demand and growing in San Francisco.
- Employers compete from the same small pool of qualified candidates, making it especially difficult for long-term care and smaller facilities, which cannot offer as competitive salaries as acute care providers.

Outreach & Recruitment

- Networking, word-of-mouth referrals and recruitment from post-secondary educational/training institutions are the most effective recruitment mechanisms for health care employers.
- Most of the employers require physical and written examinations and conduct background checks as part of the application process.

Selection & Screening Process

- Employers value soft skills but find that their employees (especially at lower-level jobs) often lack these skills and as a result, let them go.
- Employees who speak both English and Cantonese or Mandarin are in demand but some employers go abroad to fill this need because they cannot find qualified, bilingual employees locally.
- English proficiency is required for the vast majority of healthcare occupations; however, English skills are not as critical for entry level housekeeping, dieticians, activity aides and outreach workers.

Work Environment & Future Job Training Partnerships

- Healthcare employers generally offer good benefit packages and support career development through flexible work schedules, tuition reimbursement and/or paid time off for training or educational advancement.
- Several employers seemed interested in working with community-based organizations to develop a customized job training program for bilingual Cantonese or Mandarin workers in certified programs.
- Several employers seemed interested in developing a vocational English as second language program for Chinese workers.



B. Financial Services

- *Occupations in Demand*

The financial services employers in the focus group reported having a demand for many different positions. The occupations cited with the highest number of openings include: entry-level back office support workers, compliance officers, administrative assistants, mortgage and commercial lending officers, appraisers, IT administrators, retail branch managers, tellers and sales agents. Since the passage of the Patriot Act, the demand for compliance officers to ensure that banks abide by secrecy and insider trading regulations has substantially increased. With the growth of new immigrant groups in the past several years, many of the financial services representatives foresee an increasing need for multi-lingual and culturally competent marketing and sales representatives. The table below summarizes employer-verified data on the entry-level hourly wages and skill requirements for each occupation in demand, according to the financial services representatives and labor market research by NEDLC using California EDD data.

Occupation	Education/ Experience (BLS Training Level)	Entry Salary
Tellers	30-days OJT (11)	\$ 20,819
Securities, Commodities, & Financial Service Sales Agents	BA/BS Degree (5)	\$ 47,695
Brokerage Clerks	1-12 mos. OJT (10)	\$ 31,038
Insurance Sales Agents	BA/BS Degree (5)	\$ 45,522
Computer Operators; Data Entry; Word Processors; and All Other Office Support Workers	1-12 mos. OJT (10)	\$ 27,390
Business Operations Specialists, including loan specialists	BA/BS Degree (5)	\$ 38,394
Budget, Credit, Financial Analysts & Examiners, including underwriters and appraisers	BA/BS Degree (5)	\$ 50,261
First-Line Supervisors and Managers of Office & Admin Support Workers	Work Exper. (8)	\$ 35,427
Mail & Office Clerks	30-days OJT (11)	\$ 20,302
Correspondence & File Clerks	30-days OJT (11)	\$ 20,877
Compliance Officer	BA and 1-2 yrs exp.	\$55,000
Retail Branch Managers	12 months OJT; business background a plus	\$45,000+
Collectors	HS Degree and 1-12 mos. OJT	\$30,000- \$50,000



According to the financial services representatives, the most difficult positions to fill are branch bank managers, IT administrators, and commercial lending underwriters. In these positions, one employer said that the pool of talent is so limited that he would be “lucky” if he found even three qualified candidates to interview. Hiring and retaining part-time bank tellers is also very challenging.

While front-office employees must be fluent in English, limited English proficient employees may work in back office support positions including: call center operators, wire transfer workers, mail room clerks, processing center employees, data entry workers, and some IT positions. A few managers reported that between 5-10% of their workforce is limited English proficient, and a few others said that as much as 50%-60% of their workforce speaks English as a second language. For banks or insurance companies whose niche market are Chinese customers, 85% of their employees (and especially the bank tellers) are bilingual, and 15% are monolingual English speakers. These mostly bilingual employees need to know the bank operations and training materials in English, although limited English proficiency may also be sufficient.

- *Outreach and Recruitment*

Branch employees usually live within five to seven miles of the branch. Corporate-level employees may be recruited from anywhere in the country. Mid-level employees may be recruited from anywhere in the Bay Area and beyond, including San Jose, Vallejo, and Sacramento. While bank branch managers are encouraged to recruit employees, regional or national human resource managers do the majority of the recruitment and hiring. The cost of recruitment varies from \$2,500 for entry-level positions to \$5,000 for licensed banker positions with training.

Job openings are usually posted within the financial institutions for one to two weeks before advertised externally in newspapers (e.g. San Francisco Chronicle, Sing Tao), company websites, job search websites (e.g. monster.com, hotjobs.com, craigslist.org, EDD) and at job fairs, community events, colleges and high schools. Employee referral programs encourage word-of-mouth networking and referrals, although some employers complained that these referrals do not result in qualified applicants. Newspaper listings tend to be the least effective, while company websites tend to be the most effective sources of accessing new hires. One large national bank has a high school internship program from which it also successfully recruits applicants. Most

banks have on-line applications; thus, a familiarity with computers is important to get in the door. Temporary employment agencies are only used infrequently and only as a last resort.

- *Selection and Screening Process*

Competition among financial service employers to find qualified employees is tough; as a result, employers try to move applications quickly through the hiring process, which often involves a pre-screening phone interview or on-line questionnaire before applications are referred to the human resources manager or recruitment center for further screening and an interview. Applications are screened out if incomplete or contain spelling/grammatical errors. Applicants must also go through background checks, finger-printing, and every position must be bondable. Many employers routinely run credit checks, although they will sometimes hire applicants with poor credit as long as nothing illegal is reported. Drug tests are not required.

For licensed banker positions, about 25%-35% of the applicants are screened out because they do not pass the new licensing examination (a new Patriot Act regulation). For otherwise qualified applicants, some employers provide tutoring to help them retake and pass the licensing exam or absorb them into other areas of employment. For most positions, the entire application and hiring process usually takes a few weeks.

During the job interview, most employers value experience and a consistent and responsible work history. The most common reasons for eliminating a job applicant include: incomplete written applications, grammatical errors on the resume, lack of “soft” skills (such as professionalism and a positive attitude), ill-informed about the company, inadequate verbal communication skills, and failing the written examinations.

- *Work Environment*

Employers reported that they offer a variety of benefits including: medical and vision coverage, life insurance, short and long term disability, retirement savings plans, flexible work hours, vacation time, commuter checks and pension plans. Eligibility for benefits begins at different times, depending on the company, ranging from the first day on the job to five months after hire. None of the employers offer childcare. Mortgage lenders, commercial lenders and appraisers tend to have more flexible work schedules and can therefore be particularly well-suited for parents.

Most of the employers support employee training and career development, offering a combination of online e-courses and on-the-job training. One of the employers offers full training for licensed positions and was nationally recognized for its program. Many of the employers indicated that they would be interested in partnering with a community-based organization to help design a job training program, particularly for bank teller positions.

Bank teller positions have the highest turnover rates ranging from every 18 months for part-time tellers to every 2-5 years for full-time tellers. Reasons for the turnover vary but include: graduation from college; a discomfort with the sales aspect of the job; the stress of handling large sums of money while talking to customers; and too much time spent dealing with the public. Smaller employers said that the turn-over is due to the fact that they cannot promote employees quickly enough. Some employers said that new hires who are young and primarily female tend to leave to go back to school, start families or seek higher paid jobs.

A few employers thought that people who work in retail have the skills to become bank tellers because retail cashiers and restaurant workers are similarly skilled in handling sales and money. These employers suggested that their companies create a dictionary for financial service vocabulary.

Key Observations from Financial Services Sector
Employer Focus Group

Occupations in Demand

- Numerous entry-level occupations are in demand and growing.
- There are employment opportunities for limited English proficient workers in back office support positions, such as call center operators, wire transfer workers, mail room clerks, processing center employees, and some IT positions.
- Many financial services employers foresee an increasing need for multi-lingual and culturally competent marketing and sales representatives.

Outreach & Recruitment

- Employers find that their own company website postings and on-line job search engines yield the best job applicants. Thus, a familiarity with computers is important to “get in the door.”

Selection & Screening

- Employers prescreen job applications for completion, grammatical errors and passage of written examinations and then look for consistent work history and soft skills in selecting candidates.
- Most financial services employers require that job applicants undergo background checks and credit checks and, for licensed banker positions, federally-mandated written examinations.

Work Environment

- Financial service employers generally offer good benefits, encourage internal promotion and employee career development.
- Employee retention is considered a problem with bank tellers and some employers would be interested in partnering with community-based organizations to create a vocational education teller training program to address this need.
- Workers who have prior experience in retail may have transferable skills since they are skilled in handling sales and money.

FAMILY SUPPORT AND EMPLOYMENT SERVICE MAPPING

Focusing on organizations which served limited English proficient populations, the Coalition lead agency, Wu Yee Children Services, surveyed twenty-three family support and/or employment service agencies in San Francisco, (A copy of the survey instrument is in Appendix D, labeled D4.) All of the agencies surveyed were non-profit, community based service providers except City College of San Francisco, which was also included because it has a branch in Chinatown and is a larger provider of vocational training. The purpose of the survey was to identify: 1) the availability of language-specific family support and employment services; 2) gaps in family support and employment services; 3) industry-specific job training and vocational English as a second language programs; and 4) opportunities for partnerships.

Family Support Services

Table 14 below summarizes the results of the survey of the family support services. Many needed family support services identified by the residents are provided by the twenty-three agencies surveyed. Translation assistance was listed as a high priority and nine agencies provide this service. Residents also specified that it is important to have linguistically and culturally appropriate services. Most family support agencies provide services in Cantonese including: case management, counseling, childcare, healthcare referrals, health education classes, legal referrals, and translation assistance.

There is, however, a significant shortage of affordable childcare services and subsidies. Of the six agencies which provide on-site child care, four have waiting lists. One agency provides formal childcare referrals and many others provide informal referrals. The distribution of publicly-subsidized childcare vouchers, however, is centralized through two agencies in San Francisco. There is a significant waiting list to receive these vouchers, and prioritization is based on income, with the lowest income parents receiving highest priority. Thus, many parents who are income-eligible for childcare vouchers do not end up receiving the subsidy. Still other parents earn too much to qualify for subsidized childcare, but do not earn enough to afford unsubsidized childcare in the private market.

Medical services was listed by the residents as a priority need and half of the agencies surveyed provide language-specific healthcare referrals, and six provide health

Building Bridges to Help Chinese Families Reach Economic Self-Sufficiency

education classes. However, it is unclear how accessible the outside health services are to Chinese residents in terms of language, culture and affordability.

Lastly, while **housing services** was prioritized among the residents, few organizations provide this service and for those that do, there are waiting lists.



Building Bridges to Help Chinese Families Reach Economic Self-Sufficiency

Table 14: Family Support Services

Agency (Grey shading indicates the agency is currently in the Coalition.)	Case Managmt	Counseling Service	Childcare Service	Childcare Referral	Childcare Vouchers	Elderly Care Service	Emergency Assist.	Financial Lit. Class	Health Care Referral	Health Ed. Class	Housing Service	IDAs	Legal Referral	Parent Ed W'kshops	Support Group	Translation Service
Asian Neighborhood Design	E		E					E	E	E	*E		E			
Asian Women's Resource Center	C	C,M	*E,C,M							C			C	C		
Asian Perinatal Advocates	E,C,M	E,M,C						E,C	E,C,M	C			E,C,M	E, C	C,M	
Cameron House	E,C,M	E,C,M	E,C					E,C,M	E,C,M	C, M			E,C,M		C	E,M,C
Chinatown Comm. Development Ctr.	E								E	C	*E, *C					
Chinese Newcomers Service Center								C,M	C,M			C,M	C,M			C,M
Chinese Progressive Association												C, M	C, M			C,M
City College - Chinatown/ North Beach			E, C, M													
International Chinese Affairs													C,M			C, M
Jewish Vocational Services	C,M								C,M							C,M
Kai Ming Head Start	E,C,M	E,C,M	*E,C,M					E,C	E,C,M	C,M					C,M	E,C,M
Maintrain									C,M							E,C,M
Mission Hiring Hall	E								E,C							E,C
Mission Language & Vocational School		E,C,M							E,C,M							
Northeast Comm. Credit Union								E,C,M	E,C,M				*E,C,M			
Self-Help for the Elderly	C												*E,C			
SF Labor Council	E,C,M	E,C,M			E,C,M			E,C,M					E,C,M			E,C,M
Wu Yee Children's Services	E,C,M	E,C,M	*E,C,M	E,C,M	*E,C,M				E,C,M					C	C,M*	E,C,M

NOTES: 1) E = service is offered in English, C = Cantonese, M = Mandarin. Some agencies offer these services in other languages, but are not included for the purpose of this report, which focuses on services for the Chinese population. 2) An *asterisk* means that there is a waiting list for this service. 4) Chinatown Community Development Center's employment & family support services are only for tenants of their buildings and 5) Self-Help's employment & family support services are only for people over 45 or 55 yrs old.

The childcare service providers have some publicly funded childcare slots that are directly contracted with the state or city.

Employment Services

Table 15 on the following page summarizes the results of the survey of the employment service providers. It reveals that nearly all of the community-based employment services agencies surveyed provide career counseling, job placement, and job retention services, and nearly all of them provide these services in Cantonese and Mandarin. Many agencies also provide job (employment) readiness classes, although most of these classes are in English only. None of the agencies provide GED classes.

About half of the employment service agencies provide vocational job training, in addition to career counseling, job placement and retention services. Six of the twelve agencies which offer vocational job training do so in Cantonese.

Five of the 12 agencies offering **vocational training** have waiting lists, indicating a likely need for additional or expanded programs. Almost all of the employment service agencies which offer vocational training include **Vocational English as a Second Language (VESL)** and transportation assistance. However, almost half of the VESL programs have a waiting list, suggesting that there is a need for more vocational English as a second language classes.³

Only six of the twenty-three agencies surveyed provide English as a second language classes, yet residents identified ESL classes as a high priority service need and most of the employers echoed the importance of English skills. There is not a waiting list for the existing ESL classes, however, so it is unclear whether there is actually a need for more classes, or a structural barrier preventing residents from attending the classes (e.g. the time, lack of childcare, etc..)

³ The San Francisco Labor Council provides vocational ESL classes for their hospitality training program; however, there is a waitlist for applicants who are not current or laid-off hotel workers.



Building Bridges to Help Chinese Families Reach Economic Self-Sufficiency

Table 15: Employment-Related Services

Agency (Grey shading indicates the agency is currently in the Coalition.)	Career Counseling	Job Placement	Job Retention	Computer Training	Employment Readiness Class	ESL Class (General)	VESI Class	GED Class	Micro-Enterprise Development	Transportation Assistance	Vocational Training
Asian Neighborhood Design	E	E	E		*E					E	*E
Asian Perinatal Advocates	E,C,M	E,C,M	E,C,M		E,C						
Asian Women's Resource Ctr.					*E	E,C					
Cameron House	E,C,M	E,C,M	E,C,M	E,C		E, C					
Career Resources Development Ctr.	E,C	E,C,	E,C	E	E		E				E
Charity Cultural Services	C,M	C,M	C,M		E,C		*E				C*
Chinese Ctr. Employment Agency	E,C,M	E,C,M	E,C,M								
Chinese for Affirmative Action	E,C,M	E,C,M	E,C,M								
Chinatown Community Development Center (3)	E	E	E								
Chinese Newcomers Service Center	C, M	C,M	C,M	C	C,M	E,C					
Chinese Progressive Association						E,C				C,M	
City College-Chinatown/N Beach(5)	E,C,M			E, C, M	E	E	E				E, C,M
Goodwill Industries of S.F.	E, O	E,O	E,O	*E	*E						
International Chinese Affairs	C,M	C,M	C,M			E,C	E,C		C,M		E,C
Jewish Vocational Services	C,M,O	C,M	C,M	E			*E			C,M	E*
Kai Ming Head Start											E,C
Maintrain	*E,C,M	*E,C,M	E,C,M		*E,C		*E,C			C	E,C*
Mission Hiring Hall	E,C,T	E,C	E,C		E		*E				E
Mission Lang. & Vocational School	E,C,M	E,C,M	E,C,M		E		E				E
Northeast Community Federal Credit Union								E,C,M			
Self-Help for the Elderly (4)	C	C	C	C			E			C	C, E
San Francisco Labor Council	E,C,M	E,C,M	E,C,M		E		E		E,C,M	E,C,M	*E
Wu Yee Children's Services									E,C,M		

NOTES: 1) E = service is offered in English, C = Cantonese, M = Mandarin. Some agencies offer these services in other languages also.

2) An *asterisk* means that there is a waiting list for this service.

3) CCDC's Employment & Family Support Services are only for tenants of their buildings.

4) Self-Help's Employment & Family Support Services are only for people over 45 or 55 years old.

5) City College services are restricted to only those offered at the Chinatown/North Beach Branch

Industry-Specific Services

The labor market research identified Healthcare, Financial Services, Construction, Hotel & Dining and Retail Trade as mid-to-high growth sectors that may be accessible to the target population. Many of the employment agencies surveyed provide vocational ESL and job training programs in these sectors; however none of the agencies currently offer any training program in the financial services sector. (One agency does offer a program in Retail Trade, which the financial service employers indicated has some crossover skills.) Two other agencies offer programs in computerized accounting and cashier/customer services, which also may have crossover skills with the Financial Services sector.

Five of the twenty-three agencies surveyed offer vocational training in the healthcare sector, all of which prepare workers for the lower-skilled occupations (e.g. Home Health Aide, Home Custodial Worker, Nursing Assistant, or Medical Assistant.) Three agencies provide job-training services in the construction industry (including carpentry) and two of those offer vocational ESL. Three additional agencies provide job placement services in the construction industry. Seven organizations offer programs targeting the Hotel & Dining sector, all but one of which include vocational ESL as part of their program. Many of the vocational skills programs with a VESL component, however, have waiting lists. For a complete list of industry-specific job training services, refer to Appendix C, Table C2.

RECOMMENDATIONS – GAPS AND OPPORTUNITIES

Gaps in Services

1) **Childcare:** childcare is a structural barrier for Chinese residents to access living wage jobs. Many Chinese parents qualify for publicly-funded childcare vouchers but do not receive the subsidy because there are not enough vouchers, and prioritization is given to the lowest-income parents. Many other parents earn too much to qualify for publicly-funded vouchers, but do not earn enough to afford unsubsidized childcare in the private market. Thus, the Coalition should address the significant shortage of affordable childcare by joining others to press for more public funding for childcare subsidies. If possible, the Coalition should also clarify or streamline the application process to receive existing childcare services and subsidies.

2) **Healthcare and Dental Care:** the Coalition should form closer partnerships with health centers, clinics and hospitals providing language specific health care and dental care for Chinese residents, especially those without health insurance.

3) **Housing:** the Coalition should form closer partnerships with community development corporations providing affordable housing and advocating for additional publicly subsidized housing.

4) **Vocational ESL:** Given the current waitlist for many of the vocational ESL classes and the clear need for English proficient workers, the Coalition should address the shortage of vocational English as a second language classes, targeting high growth sectors with high wage jobs. The Coalition can do this by forming stronger partnerships with current vocational ESL providers and working with employers in target sectors to develop new vocational ESL programs—(as discussed further below.)

General Outreach and Recruitment

Chinese residents do not seem to be aware of many career opportunities outside of the sectors in which they are currently clustered. In designing (or partnering with) future job training programs, the Coalition should create outreach and recruitment materials which:

Building Bridges to Help Chinese Families Reach Economic Self-Sufficiency

- Inform residents about the *range* of opportunities in these growing sectors: Healthcare, Financial Services, Construction, Hotel & Dining and Retail Trade
- Dispel some misperceptions about these industries
- Highlight both the responsibilities and benefits of jobs in these industries.

Targeting Sectors

The Coalition should create or partner with other job training providers in *any* of the following sectors: **Healthcare, Financial Services, Construction, Hotel & Dining and Retail Trade**, all of which generally have moderate-to-high growth and moderate-to-high wages. Given resource constraints, NEDLC ultimately could only pursue further research on two sectors: Health Care and Financial Services. However, this does not preclude the need for similar analysis of employer needs in the other industry sectors nor does it preclude the potential for successful sectoral strategies within the other three sectors (Construction, Hotel & Dining and Retail Trade).

Health Care Sector

Structural barriers prevent many Chinese residents from entering the health care profession. **The Coalition should design or partner with other agencies to create future programs that specifically address the need for: vocational English as a second language skills, affordable childcare, career counseling and job search skills.**

Chinese residents are very motivated to work so future training programs do not need to focus on this aspect of “soft” skills training; rather, they should concentrate on teaching communication skills.

Service providers also need to better link Chinese residents with the health care industry’s informal word-of-mouth network as a way to create greater avenues to access healthcare employment opportunities. Shadowing, mentoring, or on-the-job training programs, for example, could help connect Chinese residents to the health care employers’ internal network.

There may be opportunities to partner with other job training agencies for entry-level positions in the healthcare sector which do not require English fluency (e.g. housekeeping, activity aides, outreach workers and dieticians.)

Financial Services Sector

Structural barriers prevent Chinese residents from entering the financial services sector. **The Coalition should design or partner with other agencies to create future programs that address the need for vocational English as a second language skills, job search and (on-line) job application assistance, affordable childcare, and career counseling.**

Chinese residents may also need on-the-job training or internship opportunities to gain access to financial services sector jobs since financial service employers highly value work experience. Job training programs in the financial services sector should assist Chinese residents in applying for jobs on-line and filling out complete and grammatically correct applications.

There may be opportunities for the Coalition to partner with other training and job placement service providers that target the Retail Trade and Professional Services sectors, in order to identify and train participants for occupations that have skill sets complimentary to those used within Financial Services.

The Coalition should explore opportunities to partner with other agencies or create a Financial Services job training program for back office positions which do not require English proficiency. Many of these jobs are located in San Francisco's financial district, a short distance from Chinatown. Similarly, the Coalitions should explore opportunities to partner with financial institutions to create a multilingual bank teller training program, although bank teller positions would require some degree of English proficiency.

Potential Future Partnerships: Next Steps

The Coalition should explore a future partnership with existing job training providers in the following sectors:

- *Healthcare:* Jewish Vocational Services, International Chinese Affairs, Self-Help for the Elderly, Mission Language and Vocational Training, and City College
- *Construction:* Asian Neighborhood Design, Charity Cultural Services, Mission Hiring Hall, and City College
- *Hotel & Dining:* UNITE-HERE Local 2 - California Labor Federation, Career Resources Development Center, International Chinese Affairs, Mission Hiring Hall, Charity Cultural Services, and City College
- *Retail Trade and Manufacturing:* Goodwill Industries and City College